Cigarettes with specific characterizing flavors were prohibited in the U.S. on September 22, 2009, as part of the Family Smoking Prevention and Tobacco Control Act (TCA) that gave the U.S. Food and Drug Administration (FDA) authority over tobacco products. This provision excluded menthol cigarettes, which have subsequently increased their share of the cigarette market. Data from the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) show that in 2018, menthol cigarettes comprised 36% of the market, the highest proportion on record since FTC began collecting this data in 1963. Between 2009 and 2018, sales of non-menthol cigarettes have declined by 33.1% nationally while sales of menthol cigarettes have declined by only 8.2% during the same period. 91% of the decline in cigarette sales between 2009 and 2018 is attributable to nonmenthol cigarettes.

Menthol cigarettes pose a tremendous public health threat. A 2013 FDA report on the health impact of menthol cigarettes determined that menthol cigarettes lead to increased smoking initiation among youth and young adults, greater addiction and decreased success in quitting smoking. Further, FDA’s Tobacco Products Scientific Advisory Committee’s (TPSAC) concluded, “Removal of menthol cigarettes from the marketplace would benefit public health in the United States.”

Menthol Makes it Easier for Youth to Initiate Tobacco Use

The tobacco companies know that almost all new tobacco users begin their addiction as kids, but they also know that to novice smokers, tobacco can be harsh and unappealing. Internal tobacco industry documents show that tobacco companies have a long history of using flavors to reduce the harshness of their products to make them more appealing to new users, almost all of whom are under age 18. By masking the harshness and soothing the irritation caused by tobacco smoke, flavors make it easier for beginners – primarily kids – to experiment with the product and ultimately become addicted. Menthol has particularly appealing qualities for novice smokers. Menthol is a chemical compound that cools and numbs the throat, reducing the harshness of cigarette smoke, thereby making menthol cigarettes more appealing to youth who are initiating tobacco use. As TPSAC noted, “Menthol cannot be considered merely a flavoring additive to tobacco. Its pharmacological actions reduce the harshness of smoke and the irritation from nicotine.” According to TPSAC’s conclusions:

- Menthol cigarettes increase the number of children who experiment with cigarettes and the number of children who become regular smokers, increasing overall youth smoking.
- Young people who initiate using menthol cigarettes are more likely to become addicted and become long-term daily smokers.

As the only flavored cigarette left on the market, it is no surprise that menthol cigarettes remain popular among youth. In fact, a study analyzing the impact of the 2009 ban on characterizing flavors in cigarettes on youth tobacco use found that use of menthol cigarettes among high schoolers significantly increased after the ban. Since the reports from FDA and TPSAC, research has continued to demonstrate the popularity of menthol cigarettes among youth and menthol’s role in smoking initiation:

* TPSAC is a group of scientific experts charged with advising the Commissioner of Food and Drugs on safety, dependence, and health issues relating to tobacco. See https://www.fda.gov/advisoryCommittees/CommitteesMeetingMaterials/tobaccoproductsScientificAdvisoryCommittee/default.htm for more details.
• About half of all high school smokers use menthol cigarettes. Over half a million (530,000) middle and high schoolers use menthol cigarettes.11

• The popularity of menthol-flavored cigarettes is also evidenced by brand preference among youth. According to data from the 2015 National Survey on Drug Use and Health, one in five smokers ages 12-17 prefers Newport cigarettes, a heavily marketed menthol cigarette brand. Preference for Newport is even higher among African-American youth smokers (69.1%) because of targeted marketing by the tobacco industry.12

• Data from the government’s Population Assessment of Tobacco and Health (PATH) study shows that youth menthol smokers are more likely to perceive menthol cigarettes as easier to smoke than regular cigarettes,13 that youth menthol smokers have significantly higher levels of certain measures of dependence,14 and that initiation with a menthol-flavored cigarette is associated with a higher relative risk of daily smoking.15

• Data from Truth Initiative’s Young Adult Cohort Study, a national study of 18-34 year olds, showed that 52% of new young adult smokers initiated with menthol cigarettes. Initiation with menthol cigarettes was higher among black smokers (93.1%) compared to white smokers (43.9%).16

• Data from the 2017 and 2018 National Youth Tobacco Surveys shows that among middle and high school students, menthol smoking was associated with greater smoking frequency (smoking on at least 10 of the last 30 days) and intention to continue smoking, compared to non-menthol smoking.17

**Menthol Increases Addiction and Makes it Harder for Smokers to Quit**

While the tobacco industry initially marketed menthol cigarettes as safer and healthier cigarettes, because of their cooling properties and reduced throat irritability, this could not be further from the truth.18 In fact, because menthol cigarettes are less harsh, they are associated with increased initiation and greater addiction, and FDA found that it is “likely that menthol cigarettes pose a public health risk above that seen with nonmenthol cigarettes.”19 Despite the overwhelming evidence regarding the public health harms of menthol cigarettes, misperceptions still exist. A survey of African American adult smokers in Minnesota found that over half (59%) were either unsure of the relative harm of menthol cigarettes or perceived that menthol cigarettes are less harmful than non-menthol cigarettes.20

Both TPSAC’s and FDA’s own scientific analyses conclude that menthol cigarettes are associated with increased nicotine dependence and reduced success in smoking cessation.21 TPSAC projected that by 2020, about 17,000 premature deaths will be attributable to menthol cigarettes and about 2.3 million people will have started smoking because of menthol cigarettes.22

Research published since FDA’s and TPSAC’s reports continue to bolster these findings:

• A 2014 randomized clinical trial of FDA-approved cessation treatments among 1,500 US adult smokers found that menthol smoking was associated with reduced likelihood of quitting, compared to non-menthol smoking. African American female menthol smokers had the lowest quit rates of all groups in the study.23

• A meta-analysis of findings from nearly 150,000 smokers found that among African Americans, menthol smokers have a 12% lower odds of smoking cessation compared to non-menthol smokers.24

• Relying on these studies as well as the FDA’s and TPSAC’s findings, the 2020 Surgeon General Report on Smoking Cessation determined that the evidence was suggestive, but not conclusive as to the role of menthol on smoking cessation, finding the strongest evidence for reduced likelihood of smoking cessation among African American menthol smokers.25

• Most recently, a study analyzing four waves of data from the government’s Population Assessment of Tobacco and Health (PATH) study found that among daily smokers, menthol
Menthol Cigarettes have a 24% lower odds of quitting as compared to non-menthol smokers (the study did not find a significant difference among quit rates for non-daily menthol and non-menthol smokers). Among daily smokers, African American menthol smokers had a 53% lower odds of quitting compared to African American non-menthol smokers and white menthol smokers had a 22% lower odds of quitting compared to white non-menthol smokers.\(^{26}\)

The difficulty that menthol smokers have in quitting continues to be reflected in national smoking prevalence trends. While smoking rates have declined overall in recent years, use of menthol cigarettes has increased significantly. Menthol smoking rates have increased among young adults and remained constant among youth and adults, while non-menthol smoking has decreased in all three age groups.\(^{27}\) Overall, about 4 out of 10 (39.9%) of smokers use menthol cigarettes.\(^{28}\)

In recent years, use of menthol cigarettes has increased among White, Asian, and Hispanic smokers. Use of menthol cigarettes has remained constant among African-American smokers, who continue to use menthol cigarettes more than any other racial/ethnic group.\(^{29}\) Research also shows that use of menthol cigarettes has perpetuated disparities among other groups. According to the 2018 National Survey of Drug Use and Health (NSDUH):\(^{30}\)

- 85% of African American smokers, 50% of Hispanic smokers and 47% of Asian American smokers use menthol cigarettes, compared to 29% of White smokers.
- 51% of lesbian/gay and 46% of bisexual smokers use menthol cigarettes, compared to 39% of heterosexual smokers.
- 45% of smokers with severe psychological distress use menthol cigarettes compared to 39% of smokers with no past month serious psychological distress.
- 47% of smokers living in poverty use menthol cigarettes, compared to 36% of smokers with an income exceeding twice the Federal Poverty Threshold.
- 60% of pregnant smokers use menthol cigarettes.

**Use of Menthol Cigarettes Leads to Health Disparities for African Americans**

Prevalence of menthol use is highest among African Americans – 85% of all African-American smokers smoke menthol cigarettes, compared to 29% of Whites.\(^{31}\) The tobacco industry’s “investment” in the African-American community has had a destructive impact. TPSAC’s report and FDA’s analysis conclude that African Americans are disproportionately burdened by the health harms of menthol cigarettes. Specifically, TPSAC concluded that the marketing and availability of menthol cigarettes increases the overall prevalence of smoking and reduces cessation among African Americans.\(^{32}\)

- African Americans generally have higher levels of nicotine dependence as a consequence of their preference for mentholated cigarettes.\(^{33}\) While research shows that African American smokers are highly motivated to quit smoking and are more likely than White smokers to have made a quit attempt and used counseling services in the previous year, they are less likely than White smokers to successfully quit smoking.\(^{34}\)
- Due to the lower likelihood of smoking cessation among African American menthol smokers, the 2020 Surgeon General Report on Smoking Cessation concluded that, “Use of menthol cigarettes has been shown to contribute to tobacco cessation-related disparities in the United States.”\(^{35}\)
- TPSAC estimated that by 2020, 4,700 excess deaths in the African-American community will be attributable to menthol cigarettes, and over 460,000 African Americans will have started smoking because of menthol cigarettes.\(^{36}\)
- A 2019 metaanalysis found that among African American smokers, menthol smokers had a 12% lower odds of successfully quitting smoking compared to non-menthol smokers.\(^{37}\)
- African Americans suffer the greatest burden of tobacco-related mortality of any racial or ethnic group in the United States. Each year, approximately 45,000 African Americans die from a
smoking-caused illness. Unless action is taken, an estimated 1.6 million African Americans alive today, who are now under the age of 18, will become regular smokers; and about 500,000 of these will die prematurely from a tobacco-related disease.\textsuperscript{38}

- Lung cancer is the second most common cancer in both African-American men and women, but it kills more African Americans than any other type of cancer.\textsuperscript{39} Decreased cessation success due to the popularity of menthol cigarettes among African Americans likely contributes to this mortality disparity.\textsuperscript{40}

The Tobacco Industry Targets Minorities and Youth with Menthol Cigarette Marketing

The greater popularity of menthol cigarettes among African Americans, youth, and other minorities is a direct result of a decades-long marketing campaign by the tobacco industry. In fact, TPSAC concluded that menthol cigarettes are marketed disproportionately to younger smokers and African Americans.\textsuperscript{41} Dating back to the 1950s, the tobacco industry has targeted these communities with marketing for menthol cigarettes through sponsorship of community and music events, targeted magazine advertising, youthful imagery, and marketing in the retail environment.

\textbf{Music and Community Event Sponsorship.} Beginning in the 1970s, the major tobacco companies competed for the African American market share by sponsoring music and community events like Brown & Williamson’s “Kool Jazz Festival,” R.J. Reynolds’ “Salem Summer Street Scenes,” and Phillip Morris’s “Club Benson & Hedges” promotional bar nights.\textsuperscript{42} Kool also sponsored Latin music festivals, including the branded “Kool Latino Festival,” in the 1970s and 1980s.\textsuperscript{43}

\textbf{Magazine Advertising.} Expenditures for magazine advertising of mentholated cigarettes increased from 13\% of total ad expenditures in 1998 to 76\% in 2006.\textsuperscript{44} During the two years after the Master Settlement Agreement (MSA) in November 1998, the average annual expenditures for Newport in magazines with high youth readership increased 13.2\% (from $5.3 to $6.0 million).\textsuperscript{45} Between 1998–2002, \textit{Ebony}, a magazine tailored to African-American culture, was 9.8 times more likely than \textit{People} to contain ads for menthols.\textsuperscript{46} One study comparing the English and Spanish language versions of \textit{Cosmopolitan} and \textit{Glamour} from 1998–2002 found that 51\% of the cigarette ads in the Spanish language versions were for menthol brands, compared to only 28\% in the English language versions.\textsuperscript{47}

\textbf{Youthful Imagery.} The tobacco companies commonly use youthful imagery in its advertising to appeal to young consumers. As a R.J. Reynolds document from 1981 noted, “The benefit of smoking which has most frequently and most successfully been exploited by brand families appears to be Social Interaction. For example, some brands, such as Newport, have focused on the younger adult ‘peer group’ aspect of social interaction.”\textsuperscript{48} Newport’s “Alive with Pleasure” campaign, which continues today, portrays smokers in fun, social environments in its advertisements.\textsuperscript{49} In 2004, Brown & Williamson started an ad campaign for their Kool brand cigarettes clearly aimed at youth—and African-American youth, in particular. The Kool Mixx campaign featured images of young rappers, disc jockeys and dancers on cigarette packs and in advertising. The campaign also included radio giveaways with cigarette purchases and a Hip-Hop disc jockey competition in major cities around the country. The themes, images, radio giveaways and music involved in the campaign all clearly have tremendous appeal to youth, especially African-American youth. Attorneys General from several states promptly filed motions against Brown & Williamson for violating the Master Settlement Agreement.\textsuperscript{50}

\textbf{Retail Promotions.} For decades, tobacco companies have specifically targeted minority communities, particularly African Americans, with intense advertising and promotional efforts. Beginning in the 1970s, the major tobacco companies used mobile van programs, like the Newport Pleasure Van, to expand their reach in urban areas through product sampling and coupon distribution.\textsuperscript{51} The tobacco companies also developed specific strategies and specially designed product displays to adapt their point-of-sale
marketing to smaller retailers that were more common in urban areas. Phillip Morris implemented promotion programs and paid retailers to exhibit product displays and grow their inventory. Brown & Williamson launched its Kool Inner City Point of Purchase Program, later the Kool Inner City Family Program, with the explicit goal, “to reach the core of Kool’s franchise (young, black, relatively low income and education),”52 with both retailer and consumer promotions.53 Today, menthol cigarettes continue to be heavily advertised, widely available, and priced cheaper in certain African-American communities, making them more appealing, particularly to price-sensitive youth. A wealth of research indicates that African-American neighborhoods have a disproportionate number of tobacco retailers, pervasive tobacco marketing, and in particular, more marketing of menthol products.54

- Like many minority and low-income neighborhoods, African-American neighborhoods tend to have more tobacco retailers. Nationwide, census tracts with a greater proportion of African American residents have higher tobacco retailer density.55
- A 2011 study of cigarette prices in retail stores across the U.S. found that Newport cigarettes are significantly less expensive in neighborhoods with higher proportions of African Americans.56
- The 2011 California Tobacco Advertising Survey reports that there were significantly more menthol advertisements at stores in neighborhoods with a higher proportion of African-American residents and in low-income neighborhoods.57
- Another 2011 California study found that as the proportion of African-American high school students in a neighborhood rose, the proportion of menthol advertising increased, the odds of a Newport promotion were higher, and the cost of Newport cigarettes was lower.58
- A 2013 study of tobacco retail outlets in St. Louis found more tobacco advertising, including more menthol advertising, in areas with a greater proportion of African-American residents.59 Another 2013 study found similar patterns in Ramsey County, Minnesota.60

FDA Action Needed to Prohibit Menthol Cigarettes

Despite strong evidence from the FDA and TSPAC reports and continued research on the public health harms, the FDA has yet to take action to prohibit menthol cigarettes. In 2013, the FDA issued an Advanced Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (ANPRM), soliciting additional research and comments from the public on prohibiting menthol cigarettes. In 2018, the FDA issued another ANPRM, seeking additional evidence on the public health harms of menthol cigarettes, along with other flavored tobacco products. Neither of these ANPRMs have led to the issuance of a rule to prohibit menthol cigarettes; however, in November 2018, FDA Commissioner Scott Gottlieb announced the agency’s intention to ban menthol in combustible tobacco products, including cigarettes and cigars.61 This announcement received strong support from the public health and African American communities, including the National Association for the Advancement of Colored People (NAACP), the National Urban League, the National African American Tobacco Prevention Network and the African American Tobacco Control Leadership Council.62

State and Local Action to Restrict the Sale of Menthol Tobacco Products

States and localities can implement additional sales restrictions on menthol cigarettes and flavored non-cigarette tobacco products.

- In November 2019, Massachusetts enacted the first statewide ban on the sale of all flavored tobacco products, including menthol cigarettes (effective 6/1/20). In August 2020, California became the second state to ban menthol cigarettes, along with flavored e-cigarettes and most other flavored tobacco products (implementation pending referendum vote).
- In 2017, the San Francisco Board of Supervisors unanimously passed an ordinance to prohibit the sale of all flavored tobacco products, including menthol cigarettes and e-cigarettes, becoming the first major U.S. city to enact a comprehensive ban.63 This law was originally slated to go into effect on April 1, 2018. However, R.J. Reynolds, manufacturer of the top-selling menthol brand,
quickly responded by gathering signatures for a referendum petition, allowing voters to decide on the June 2018 ballot whether the restriction should be implemented. San Francisco residents overwhelmingly voted (68.4% to 31.6%) to implement the flavored tobacco sales restriction, despite the industry spending nearly $12 million to try to defeat the initiative.

Now, over 100 localities from California to Illinois to Minnesota restrict or ban the sale of menthol cigarettes.

The Canadian government banned menthol cigarettes in October 2017, although most provinces had banned menthol cigarettes prior to the nationwide law. Surveillance from Ontario, which banned menthol cigarettes on January 2017 shows promising evidence that banning menthol cigarettes increases quit attempts and cessation:

- A 1-year follow-up survey found that both daily and occasional menthol smokers were more likely to report having quit smoking (24% and 20%, vs 14%) or having made a quit attempt (63% and 62%, vs 43%), compared to non-menthol smokers.
- A 2-year follow-up survey found that both daily and occasional menthol smokers were more likely to report having quit smoking for 6 months (18% and 15%, vs 7%) or having made a quit attempt (72% and 74%, vs 58%), compared to non-menthol smokers.

Research on the impact of Canada’s national ban is also starting to emerge. Data from the International Tobacco Control Policy Evaluation Project (ITC) are consistent with the findings on the impact of the Ontario ban. Specifically, ITC researchers, using longitudinal surveys of Canadian smokers found that following the national ban, menthol smokers were more likely to try to quit than non-menthol smokers (60% vs. 48%), and were twice as likely to have quit smoking for at least six months (12% vs. 6%). It is important to note that menthol cigarettes comprised a much smaller proportion of the Canadian cigarette marketplace (~5%) than the US marketplace (36%), and the demographics of menthol smokers are very different between the two countries.

In May 2020, the European Union and the United Kingdom banned the sale of menthol cigarettes, but research is not yet available on the impact of these bans.

Campaign for Tobacco-Free Kids, January 14, 2021 / Laura Bach


---

1 See U.S. Food and Drug Administration’s (FDA) Flavored Tobacco webpage at http://www.fda.gov/TobaccoProducts/GuidanceComplianceRegulatoryInformation/FlavoredTobacco/default.htm.
Menthol Cigarettes / 7

Menthol Cigarettes


